

# A curious collection of creative conundrums

Mike Daas

Universiteit Leiden

13 mei 2024



Universiteit  
Leiden

# Plan for today

# Plan for today

Let's be honest.

# Plan for today

Let's be honest.

You are not motivated to work on your PhD project 24/7.

# Plan for today

Let's be honest.

You are not motivated to work on your PhD project 24/7.

That's okay. Neither am I.

# Plan for today

Let's be honest.

You are not motivated to work on your PhD project 24/7.

That's okay. Neither am I.

But not working on your maths makes you feel guilty :(

# Plan for today

Let's be honest.

You are not motivated to work on your PhD project 24/7.

That's okay. Neither am I.

But not working on your maths makes you feel guilty :(

Solution: still work on maths. But fun maths :)

# Plan for today

Let's be honest.

You are not motivated to work on your PhD project 24/7.

That's okay. Neither am I.

But not working on your maths makes you feel guilty :(

Solution: still work on maths. But fun maths :)

Today, I will discuss three problems that I came up with:



# Plan for today

Let's be honest.

You are not motivated to work on your PhD project 24/7.

That's okay. Neither am I.

But not working on your maths makes you feel guilty :(

Solution: still work on maths. But fun maths :)

Today, I will discuss three problems that I came up with:

- Monic polynomials that vanish  $\pmod{m}$ ;

# Plan for today

Let's be honest.

You are not motivated to work on your PhD project 24/7.

That's okay. Neither am I.

But not working on your maths makes you feel guilty :(

Solution: still work on maths. But fun maths :)

Today, I will discuss three problems that I came up with:

- Monic polynomials that vanish  $\pmod{m}$ ;
- Scalar endomorphisms in abelian groups;

# Plan for today

Let's be honest.

You are not motivated to work on your PhD project 24/7.

That's okay. Neither am I.

But not working on your maths makes you feel guilty :(

Solution: still work on maths. But fun maths :)

Today, I will discuss three problems that I came up with:

- Monic polynomials that vanish  $\pmod m$ ;
- Scalar endomorphisms in abelian groups;
- A Collatz-type problem.

# Plan for today

Let's be honest.

You are not motivated to work on your PhD project 24/7.

That's okay. Neither am I.

But not working on your maths makes you feel guilty :(

Solution: still work on maths. But fun maths :)

Today, I will discuss three problems that I came up with:

- Monic polynomials that vanish  $\pmod{m}$ ;
- Scalar endomorphisms in abelian groups;
- A Collatz-type problem.

Then I will solve them for you. Just for fun :)

# Part 1: Problems

# Problem I (1/4)

## Question

Fix  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . What is the smallest degree  $d$  of a polynomial  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  with the property that  $p(n)$  is divisible by  $m$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ ?

## Problem I (1/4)

### Question

Fix  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . What is the smallest degree  $d$  of a polynomial  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  with the property that  $p(n)$  is divisible by  $m$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ ?

Answer:  $d = 0$ , for choose  $p(X) = m$  constant. That's boring...

## Problem I (1/4)

### Question

Fix  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . What is the smallest degree  $d$  of a polynomial  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  with with the property that  $p(n)$  is divisible by  $m$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ ?

Answer:  $d = 0$ , for choose  $p(X) = m$  constant. That's boring...

### Definition

We say some  $p = \sum_{i=0}^d a_i x^i \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  is *monic* if  $a_d = 1$ .



## Problem I (1/4)

### Question

Fix  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . What is the smallest degree  $d$  of a polynomial  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  with the property that  $p(n)$  is divisible by  $m$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ ?

Answer:  $d = 0$ , for choose  $p(X) = m$  constant. That's boring...

### Definition

We say some  $p = \sum_{i=0}^d a_i x^i \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  is *monic* if  $a_d = 1$ .

### Question

Fix  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . What is the smallest degree  $d$  of a *monic*  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  with the property that  $p(n)$  is divisible by  $m$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ ?

## Problem I (1/4)

### Question

Fix  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . What is the smallest degree  $d$  of a polynomial  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  with the property that  $p(n)$  is divisible by  $m$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ ?

Answer:  $d = 0$ , for choose  $p(X) = m$  constant. That's boring...

### Definition

We say some  $p = \sum_{i=0}^d a_i x^i \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  is *monic* if  $a_d = 1$ .

### Question

Fix  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . What is the smallest degree  $d$  of a *monic*  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  with the property that  $p(n)$  is divisible by  $m$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ ?

- Clearly, if  $m = 1$ , then  $p = 1$  works, so  $d = 0$ .
- If  $m = 2$ , then

## Problem I (1/4)

### Question

Fix  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . What is the smallest degree  $d$  of a polynomial  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  with with the property that  $p(n)$  is divisible by  $m$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ ?

Answer:  $d = 0$ , for choose  $p(X) = m$  constant. That's boring...

### Definition

We say some  $p = \sum_{i=0}^d a_i x^i \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  is *monic* if  $a_d = 1$ .

### Question

Fix  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . What is the smallest degree  $d$  of a *monic*  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  with with the property that  $p(n)$  is divisible by  $m$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ ?

- Clearly, if  $m = 1$ , then  $p = 1$  works, so  $d = 0$ .
- If  $m = 2$ , then  $p = X^2 - X$  works, so  $d = 2$ .
- If  $m = 3$ , then...?

## Problem I (2/4)

Can  $X^2 + aX + b$  always be divisible by 3?

## Problem I (2/4)

Can  $X^2 + aX + b$  always be divisible by 3?

- $X = 0$  gives  $b \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$ , so let's say  $b = 0$ .

## Problem I (2/4)

Can  $X^2 + aX + b$  always be divisible by 3?

- $X = 0$  gives  $b \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$ , so let's say  $b = 0$ .
- $X = 1$  gives  $1 + a \equiv 0 \pmod{3} \implies a \equiv -1 \pmod{3}$ .
- $X = 2$  gives  $4 + 2a \equiv 0 \pmod{3} \implies a \equiv -2 \pmod{3}$ .

## Problem I (2/4)

Can  $X^2 + aX + b$  always be divisible by 3?

- $X = 0$  gives  $b \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$ , so let's say  $b = 0$ .
- $X = 1$  gives  $1 + a \equiv 0 \pmod{3} \implies a \equiv -1 \pmod{3}$ .
- $X = 2$  gives  $4 + 2a \equiv 0 \pmod{3} \implies a \equiv -2 \pmod{3}$ .

This is a contradiction, so the answer is *no*.

What about degree 3?

## Problem I (2/4)

Can  $X^2 + aX + b$  always be divisible by 3?

- $X = 0$  gives  $b \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$ , so let's say  $b = 0$ .
- $X = 1$  gives  $1 + a \equiv 0 \pmod{3} \implies a \equiv -1 \pmod{3}$ .
- $X = 2$  gives  $4 + 2a \equiv 0 \pmod{3} \implies a \equiv -2 \pmod{3}$ .

This is a contradiction, so the answer is *no*.

What about degree 3?

Consider  $p = X^3 - X$ . Then

$$p(0) = 0, \quad p(1) = 0, \quad \text{and} \quad p(2) = 6.$$

Since  $p(X + 3) \equiv p(X) \pmod{3}$ , this is indeed always divisible by 3.



## Problem I (2/4)

Can  $X^2 + aX + b$  always be divisible by 3?

- $X = 0$  gives  $b \equiv 0 \pmod{3}$ , so let's say  $b = 0$ .
- $X = 1$  gives  $1 + a \equiv 0 \pmod{3} \implies a \equiv -1 \pmod{3}$ .
- $X = 2$  gives  $4 + 2a \equiv 0 \pmod{3} \implies a \equiv -2 \pmod{3}$ .

This is a contradiction, so the answer is *no*.

What about degree 3?

Consider  $p = X^3 - X$ . Then

$$p(0) = 0, \quad p(1) = 0, \quad \text{and} \quad p(2) = 6.$$

Since  $p(X + 3) \equiv p(X) \pmod{3}$ , this is indeed always divisible by 3.

But really  $p = (X - 1)X(X + 1)$ ; one of three consecutive numbers will always be divisible by 3. Therefore, for any  $m$ , we can take

$$p = (X + 1) \cdots (X + m);$$

this will always be divisible by  $m$ . Therefore,  $d \leq m$ .

## Problem I (3/4)

Can  $X^3 + aX^2 + bX + c$  always be divisible by 4?

## Problem I (3/4)

Can  $X^3 + aX^2 + bX + c$  always be divisible by 4?

- $X = 0$  gives  $c \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ , so let's say  $c = 0$ .

## Problem I (3/4)

Can  $X^3 + aX^2 + bX + c$  always be divisible by 4?

- $X = 0$  gives  $c \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ , so let's say  $c = 0$ .
- $X = 1$  gives  $1 + a + b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies a + b \equiv -1 \pmod{4}$ .
- $X = 2$  gives  $8 + 4a + 2b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies 2b \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ .
- $X = -1$  gives  $-1 + a - b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies a - b \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$ .

## Problem I (3/4)

Can  $X^3 + aX^2 + bX + c$  always be divisible by 4?

- $X = 0$  gives  $c \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ , so let's say  $c = 0$ .
- $X = 1$  gives  $1 + a + b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies a + b \equiv -1 \pmod{4}$ .
- $X = 2$  gives  $8 + 4a + 2b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies 2b \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ .
- $X = -1$  gives  $-1 + a - b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies a - b \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$ .

The second and fourth give  $2b \equiv 2 \pmod{4}$ . This contradicts the third, so the answer is *no*. Therefore,  $d = 4$ .

## Problem I (3/4)

Can  $X^3 + aX^2 + bX + c$  always be divisible by 4?

- $X = 0$  gives  $c \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ , so let's say  $c = 0$ .
- $X = 1$  gives  $1 + a + b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies a + b \equiv -1 \pmod{4}$ .
- $X = 2$  gives  $8 + 4a + 2b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies 2b \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ .
- $X = -1$  gives  $-1 + a - b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies a - b \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$ .

The second and fourth give  $2b \equiv 2 \pmod{4}$ . This contradicts the third, so the answer is *no*. Therefore,  $d = 4$ .

Let  $m = 5$ . This is prime, so the polynomial

$$\bar{p} \in \mathbb{F}_5[X]$$

can only have  $d$  zeroes. It should have 5 zeroes, so  $d = 5$  again.

## Problem I (3/4)

Can  $X^3 + aX^2 + bX + c$  always be divisible by 4?

- $X = 0$  gives  $c \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ , so let's say  $c = 0$ .
- $X = 1$  gives  $1 + a + b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies a + b \equiv -1 \pmod{4}$ .
- $X = 2$  gives  $8 + 4a + 2b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies 2b \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ .
- $X = -1$  gives  $-1 + a - b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies a - b \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$ .

The second and fourth give  $2b \equiv 2 \pmod{4}$ . This contradicts the third, so the answer is *no*. Therefore,  $d = 4$ .

Let  $m = 5$ . This is prime, so the polynomial

$$\bar{p} \in \mathbb{F}_5[X]$$

can only have  $d$  zeroes. It should have 5 zeroes, so  $d = 5$  again. So if  $m$  is prime, we must have  $d = m$ . Does this always hold?

## Problem I (3/4)

Can  $X^3 + aX^2 + bX + c$  always be divisible by 4?

- $X = 0$  gives  $c \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ , so let's say  $c = 0$ .
- $X = 1$  gives  $1 + a + b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies a + b \equiv -1 \pmod{4}$ .
- $X = 2$  gives  $8 + 4a + 2b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies 2b \equiv 0 \pmod{4}$ .
- $X = -1$  gives  $-1 + a - b \equiv 0 \pmod{4} \implies a - b \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$ .

The second and fourth give  $2b \equiv 2 \pmod{4}$ . This contradicts the third, so the answer is *no*. Therefore,  $d = 4$ .

Let  $m = 5$ . This is prime, so the polynomial

$$\bar{p} \in \mathbb{F}_5[X]$$

can only have  $d$  zeroes. It should have 5 zeroes, so  $d = 5$  again.

So if  $m$  is prime, we must have  $d = m$ . Does this always hold?

Look back at  $p = (X - 1)X(X + 1)$ . This is always divisible by 3, but also by 2. Therefore, for  $m = 6$ , we have  $d = 3$ ...



## Problem I (4/4)

Are the polynomials  $p = (X + 1) \cdots (X + d)$  sometimes *better* than “just” divisible by  $d$ ? Yes!

## Problem I (4/4)

Are the polynomials  $p = (X + 1) \cdots (X + d)$  sometimes *better* than “just” divisible by  $d$ ? Yes!

### Lemma

For any  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ , the product  $(n + 1) \cdots (n + d)$  is divisible by  $d!$ .

## Problem I (4/4)

Are the polynomials  $p = (X + 1) \cdots (X + d)$  sometimes *better* than “just” divisible by  $d$ ? Yes!

### Lemma

For any  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ , the product  $(n + 1) \cdots (n + d)$  is divisible by  $d!$ .

### Proof.

Indeed, note that

$$\frac{(n + 1) \cdots (n + d)}{d!} = \frac{(n + d)!}{n!d!} = \binom{n + d}{d} \in \mathbb{Z},$$

proving the claim. □

## Problem I (4/4)

Are the polynomials  $p = (X + 1) \cdots (X + d)$  sometimes *better* than “just” divisible by  $d$ ? Yes!

### Lemma

For any  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ , the product  $(n + 1) \cdots (n + d)$  is divisible by  $d!$ .

### Proof.

Indeed, note that

$$\frac{(n + 1) \cdots (n + d)}{d!} = \frac{(n + d)!}{n!d!} = \binom{n + d}{d} \in \mathbb{Z},$$

proving the claim. □

### Conjecture

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .

## Problem II (1/3)

### Question

Let  $G$  be an abelian group and let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be a group endomorphism. Suppose that for each  $g \in G$ , there exists some integer  $k_g \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = k_g g$ . Does there necessarily exist some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = kg$  for all  $g \in G$ ?

## Problem II (1/3)

### Question

Let  $G$  be an abelian group and let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be a group endomorphism. Suppose that for each  $g \in G$ , there exists some integer  $k_g \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = k_g g$ . Does there necessarily exist some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = kg$  for all  $g \in G$ ?

Answer: *no*.

## Problem II (1/3)

### Question

Let  $G$  be an abelian group and let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be a group endomorphism. Suppose that for each  $g \in G$ , there exists some integer  $k_g \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = k_g g$ . Does there necessarily exist some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = kg$  for all  $g \in G$ ?

Answer: *no*.

### Definition

Let  $G_1, G_2, \dots$  be a sequence of abelian groups. Then define the *direct sum*  $G$  of these groups as the set

$$G = \bigoplus_{n=1}^{\infty} G_n = \{(g_1, g_2, \dots) \mid g_n = 0 \text{ for all but finitely many } n\},$$

with coordinate-wise addition.

## Problem II (2/3)

Consider the group

$$G = \bigoplus_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathbb{Z}/3^n\mathbb{Z}.$$

Let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be given by “multiplication by  $1/2$ ”, i.e.  $2f(g) = g$  for all  $g \in G$ .



## Problem II (2/3)

Consider the group

$$G = \bigoplus_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathbb{Z}/3^n\mathbb{Z}.$$

Let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be given by “multiplication by  $1/2$ ”, i.e.  $2f(g) = g$  for all  $g \in G$ . On each component,

$$\mathbb{Z}/3^n\mathbb{Z} \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}/3^n\mathbb{Z} : g \mapsto \frac{3^n + 1}{2}g.$$

Clearly  $f$  is not multiplication by a fixed  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

## Problem II (2/3)

Consider the group

$$G = \bigoplus_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathbb{Z}/3^n\mathbb{Z}.$$

Let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be given by “multiplication by  $1/2$ ”, i.e.  $2f(g) = g$  for all  $g \in G$ . On each component,

$$\mathbb{Z}/3^n\mathbb{Z} \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}/3^n\mathbb{Z} : g \mapsto \frac{3^n + 1}{2}g.$$

Clearly  $f$  is not multiplication by a fixed  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ . However, if  $g \in G$ , then

$$g = (g_1, g_2, \dots, g_n, 0, 0, \dots)$$

for some  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Then

$$f(g) = \frac{3^n + 1}{2}g.$$

Therefore we have found a counter-example.

## Problem II (3/3)

### Question

Let  $G$  be a *finitely generated* abelian group and let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be a group endomorphism. Suppose that for each  $g \in G$ , there exists some integer  $k_g \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = k_g g$ . Does there necessarily exist some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = kg$  for all  $g \in G$ ?

## Problem II (3/3)

### Question

Let  $G$  be a *finitely generated* abelian group and let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be a group endomorphism. Suppose that for each  $g \in G$ , there exists some integer  $k_g \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = k_g g$ . Does there necessarily exist some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = kg$  for all  $g \in G$ ?

### Theorem

Let  $G$  be a finitely generated abelian group. Then

$$G \cong T \times \mathbb{Z}^n$$

for some finite abelian group  $T$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

## Problem II (3/3)

### Question

Let  $G$  be a *finitely generated* abelian group and let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be a group endomorphism. Suppose that for each  $g \in G$ , there exists some integer  $k_g \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = k_g g$ . Does there necessarily exist some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = kg$  for all  $g \in G$ ?

### Theorem

Let  $G$  be a finitely generated abelian group. Then

$$G \cong T \times \mathbb{Z}^n$$

for some finite abelian group  $T$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Suppose  $G$  is generated by one element  $g$ . Then every  $f : G \rightarrow G$  is mult. by some fixed  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ . Indeed, if  $f(g) = kg$ , then  $k$  always works.

## Problem II (3/3)

### Question

Let  $G$  be a *finitely generated* abelian group and let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be a group endomorphism. Suppose that for each  $g \in G$ , there exists some integer  $k_g \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = k_g g$ . Does there necessarily exist some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = kg$  for all  $g \in G$ ?

### Theorem

Let  $G$  be a finitely generated abelian group. Then

$$G \cong T \times \mathbb{Z}^n$$

for some finite abelian group  $T$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Suppose  $G$  is generated by one element  $g$ . Then every  $f : G \rightarrow G$  is mult. by some fixed  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ . Indeed, if  $f(g) = kg$ , then  $k$  always works. But what about 2 generators? Or more?

## Problem III (1/3)

### The Collatz Conjecture

Define a function  $f : \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  by

$$f(n) = \begin{cases} 3n + 1 & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ n/2 & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

Does the sequence  $n, f(n), f(f(n)), \dots$  always eventually reach 1?

## Problem III (1/3)

### The Collatz Conjecture

Define a function  $f : \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  by

$$f(n) = \begin{cases} 3n + 1 & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ n/2 & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

Does the sequence  $n, f(n), f(f(n)), \dots$  always eventually reach 1?

Famously difficult open problem. I won't claim to be able to solve it.



## Problem III (1/3)

### The Collatz Conjecture

Define a function  $f : \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  by

$$f(n) = \begin{cases} 3n + 1 & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ n/2 & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

Does the sequence  $n, f(n), f(f(n)), \dots$  always eventually reach 1?

Famously difficult open problem. I won't claim to be able to solve it.

### Question

Define a function  $f : \mathbb{N} \setminus \{1\} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  by

$$f(n) = \begin{cases} n^2 - 1 & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ n/2 & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

When does the sequence  $n, f(n), f(f(n)), \dots$  ever reach the number 1?

## Problem III (2/3)

### Remark 1

If  $n$  is odd, then  $n^2 \equiv 1 \pmod{8}$ .

Fix  $t \in \mathbb{Z}$  odd. Define a function  $f : \mathbb{N} \setminus \{1\} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  by

$$f(n) = \begin{cases} n^2 - t & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ n/2 & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

## Problem III (2/3)

### Remark 1

If  $n$  is odd, then  $n^2 \equiv 1 \pmod{8}$ .

Fix  $t \in \mathbb{Z}$  odd. Define a function  $f : \mathbb{N} \setminus \{1\} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  by

$$f(n) = \begin{cases} n^2 - t & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ n/2 & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

If  $t \not\equiv 1 \pmod{8}$ , then  $n^2 - t \in \{2, 4, 6\} \pmod{8}$ , so we only divide by 2 at most once or twice. So as soon as  $n^2 - t > 4n$ , the sequence grows forever - not very interesting.

## Problem III (2/3)

### Remark 1

If  $n$  is odd, then  $n^2 \equiv 1 \pmod{8}$ .

Fix  $t \in \mathbb{Z}$  odd. Define a function  $f : \mathbb{N} \setminus \{1\} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  by

$$f(n) = \begin{cases} n^2 - t & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ n/2 & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

If  $t \not\equiv 1 \pmod{8}$ , then  $n^2 - t \in \{2, 4, 6\} \pmod{8}$ , so we only divide by 2 at most once or twice. So as soon as  $n^2 - t > 4n$ , the sequence grows forever - not very interesting.

### Remark 2

I proposed the  $t = -3$  case to the Dutch mathematics olympiad; then only  $1 \rightarrow 4 \rightarrow 2 \rightarrow 1$  and  $3 \rightarrow 12 \rightarrow 6 \rightarrow 3$  do not explode. It was selected; a great problem for smart high schoolers :)

## Problem III (3/3)

3  $\mapsto$  8  $\mapsto$  4  $\mapsto$  2  $\mapsto$  1

5  $\mapsto$  24  $\mapsto$  12  $\mapsto$  6  $\mapsto$  3

7  $\mapsto$  48  $\mapsto$  24

9  $\mapsto$  80  $\mapsto$  40  $\mapsto$  20  $\mapsto$  10  $\mapsto$  5

11  $\mapsto$  120  $\mapsto$  60  $\mapsto$  30  $\mapsto$  15  $\mapsto$  224  $\mapsto$  112  $\mapsto$  56  $\mapsto$  28  $\mapsto$  14  $\mapsto$  7

13  $\mapsto$  168  $\mapsto$  84  $\mapsto$  42  $\mapsto$  21  $\mapsto$  440  $\mapsto$  220  $\mapsto$  110  $\mapsto$  55  $\mapsto$  3024  $\mapsto$  ...

17  $\mapsto$  288  $\mapsto$  144  $\mapsto$  72  $\mapsto$  36  $\mapsto$  18  $\mapsto$  9

19  $\mapsto$  360  $\mapsto$  180  $\mapsto$  90  $\mapsto$  45  $\mapsto$  2024  $\mapsto$  1012  $\mapsto$  506  $\mapsto$  253  $\mapsto$  ...

23  $\mapsto$  528  $\mapsto$  264  $\mapsto$  132  $\mapsto$  66  $\mapsto$  33  $\mapsto$  1088  $\mapsto$  544  $\mapsto$  272  $\mapsto$  136  $\mapsto$   
68  $\mapsto$  34  $\mapsto$  17

## Problem III (3/3)

$3 \mapsto 8 \mapsto 4 \mapsto 2 \mapsto 1$

$5 \mapsto 24 \mapsto 12 \mapsto 6 \mapsto 3$

$7 \mapsto 48 \mapsto 24$

$9 \mapsto 80 \mapsto 40 \mapsto 20 \mapsto 10 \mapsto 5$

$11 \mapsto 120 \mapsto 60 \mapsto 30 \mapsto 15 \mapsto 224 \mapsto 112 \mapsto 56 \mapsto 28 \mapsto 14 \mapsto 7$

$13 \mapsto 168 \mapsto 84 \mapsto 42 \mapsto 21 \mapsto 440 \mapsto 220 \mapsto 110 \mapsto 55 \mapsto 3024 \mapsto \dots$

$17 \mapsto 288 \mapsto 144 \mapsto 72 \mapsto 36 \mapsto 18 \mapsto 9$

$19 \mapsto 360 \mapsto 180 \mapsto 90 \mapsto 45 \mapsto 2024 \mapsto 1012 \mapsto 506 \mapsto 253 \mapsto \dots$

$23 \mapsto 528 \mapsto 264 \mapsto 132 \mapsto 66 \mapsto 33 \mapsto 1088 \mapsto 544 \mapsto 272 \mapsto 136 \mapsto$   
 $68 \mapsto 34 \mapsto 17$

### Remark

Since  $n^2 - 1 = (n - 1)(n + 1)$ , if we have  $n = 2^k \pm 1$ , then  $f(n) = 2^{k+1} \cdot (2^{k-1} \pm 1)$ , so by induction these numbers will always go down to 1. But this does not explain 11 or 23...

# Part 2: Solutions

## Conjecture

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .



# Solution I (1/2)

## Conjecture

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .

## Definition

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  be any polynomial. Then define its *discrete derivative* by

$$(\Delta p)(X) = p(X + 1) - p(X).$$

# Solution I (1/2)

## Conjecture

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .

## Definition

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  be any polynomial. Then define its *discrete derivative* by

$$(\Delta p)(X) = p(X + 1) - p(X).$$

## Lemma

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  be of degree  $d$ . Then:

- The degree of  $\Delta p$  is precisely  $d - 1$ ;

# Solution I (1/2)

## Conjecture

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .

## Definition

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  be any polynomial. Then define its *discrete derivative* by

$$(\Delta p)(X) = p(X + 1) - p(X).$$

## Lemma

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  be of degree  $d$ . Then:

- The degree of  $\Delta p$  is precisely  $d - 1$ ;
- If  $p(n)$  is an integer for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then so is  $(\Delta p)(n)$ .

# Solution I (1/2)

## Conjecture

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .

## Definition

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  be any polynomial. Then define its *discrete derivative* by

$$(\Delta p)(X) = p(X + 1) - p(X).$$

## Lemma

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  be of degree  $d$ . Then:

- The degree of  $\Delta p$  is precisely  $d - 1$ ;
- If  $p(n)$  is an integer for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then so is  $(\Delta p)(n)$ .
- The leading coefficient of  $\Delta p$  is precisely  $d$  times that of  $p$ .

The first two are trivial, and indeed  $(X + 1)^d - X^d = dX^{d-1} + \dots$

### Theorem

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .

## Solution I (2/2)

### Theorem

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .

### Proof.

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  be any polynomial with  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  and let  $d$  denote its degree. Then the polynomial  $P = p/m \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  satisfies  $P(n) \in \mathbb{Z}$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

## Solution I (2/2)

### Theorem

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .

### Proof.

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  be any polynomial with  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  and let  $d$  denote its degree. Then the polynomial  $P = p/m \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  satisfies  $P(n) \in \mathbb{Z}$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ . Now consider  $\Delta^d P$ . Then:

## Solution I (2/2)

### Theorem

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .

### Proof.

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  be any polynomial with  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  and let  $d$  denote its degree. Then the polynomial  $P = p/m \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  satisfies  $P(n) \in \mathbb{Z}$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ . Now consider  $\Delta^d P$ . Then:

- Since the degree drops by 1 for each application of  $\Delta$ , the degree of  $\Delta^d P$  is zero. In other words, it is constant.



## Solution I (2/2)

### Theorem

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .

### Proof.

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  be any polynomial with  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  and let  $d$  denote its degree. Then the polynomial  $P = p/m \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  satisfies  $P(n) \in \mathbb{Z}$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ . Now consider  $\Delta^d P$ . Then:

- Since the degree drops by 1 for each application of  $\Delta$ , the degree of  $\Delta^d P$  is zero. In other words, it is constant.
- Its leading coefficient is first multiplied by  $d$ , then by  $d - 1$ , then by  $d - 2$ , etc. We started with  $1/m$ , so we end up with  $d!/m$ .

## Solution I (2/2)

### Theorem

Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . There exists a polynomial of degree  $d$  such that  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  if and only if  $m \mid d!$ .

### Proof.

Let  $p \in \mathbb{Z}[X]$  be any polynomial with  $m \mid p(n)$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$  and let  $d$  denote its degree. Then the polynomial  $P = p/m \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  satisfies  $P(n) \in \mathbb{Z}$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ . Now consider  $\Delta^d P$ . Then:

- Since the degree drops by 1 for each application of  $\Delta$ , the degree of  $\Delta^d P$  is zero. In other words, it is constant.
- Its leading coefficient is first multiplied by  $d$ , then by  $d - 1$ , then by  $d - 2$ , etc. We started with  $1/m$ , so we end up with  $d!/m$ .
- $(\Delta^d P)(n) \in \mathbb{Z}$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ , because this was true for  $P$ , and  $\Delta$  conserves this property.

In other words,  $\Delta^d P = d!/m \in \mathbb{Z}$ . □

## Solution II (1/4)

### Question

Let  $G$  be a *finitely generated* abelian group and let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be a group endomorphism. Suppose that for each  $g \in G$ , there exists some integer  $k_g \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = k_g g$ . Does there necessarily exist some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = kg$  for all  $g \in G$ ?

## Solution II (1/4)

### Question

Let  $G$  be a *finitely generated* abelian group and let  $f : G \rightarrow G$  be a group endomorphism. Suppose that for each  $g \in G$ , there exists some integer  $k_g \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = k_g g$ . Does there necessarily exist some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $f(g) = kg$  for all  $g \in G$ ?

We will proceed by induction on the number of generators of  $G$ .

### Two generators (1/2)

If  $G$  has two generators, then either

$$G \cong C_n \times C_m, \quad G \cong \mathbb{Z} \times C_n, \quad \text{or} \quad G \cong \mathbb{Z} \times \mathbb{Z}.$$

In any case, we can find  $a, b \in G$  such that

$$\langle a, b \rangle = G \quad \text{and} \quad \langle a \rangle \cap \langle b \rangle = \{0\}.$$

## Solution II (2/4)

### Two generators (2/2)

So take  $a, b \in G$  such that

$$\langle a, b \rangle = G \quad \text{and} \quad \langle a \rangle \cap \langle b \rangle = \{0\}.$$

By assumption, there exist  $x, y, z \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that

$$f(a) = xa, \quad f(b) = yb \quad \text{and} \quad f(a + b) = z(a + b).$$

## Solution II (2/4)

### Two generators (2/2)

So take  $a, b \in G$  such that

$$\langle a, b \rangle = G \quad \text{and} \quad \langle a \rangle \cap \langle b \rangle = \{0\}.$$

By assumption, there exist  $x, y, z \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that

$$f(a) = xa, \quad f(b) = yb \quad \text{and} \quad f(a + b) = z(a + b).$$

But then

$$0 = f(a + b) - f(a) - f(b) = (z - x)a + (z - y)b.$$

## Solution II (2/4)

### Two generators (2/2)

So take  $a, b \in G$  such that

$$\langle a, b \rangle = G \quad \text{and} \quad \langle a \rangle \cap \langle b \rangle = \{0\}.$$

By assumption, there exist  $x, y, z \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that

$$f(a) = xa, \quad f(b) = yb \quad \text{and} \quad f(a + b) = z(a + b).$$

But then

$$0 = f(a + b) - f(a) - f(b) = (z - x)a + (z - y)b.$$

Since  $\langle a \rangle \cap \langle b \rangle = \{0\}$ , it thus follows that

$$(z - x)a = 0 \quad \text{and} \quad (z - y)b = 0 \implies xa = za \quad \text{and} \quad yb = zb.$$

## Solution II (2/4)

### Two generators (2/2)

So take  $a, b \in G$  such that

$$\langle a, b \rangle = G \quad \text{and} \quad \langle a \rangle \cap \langle b \rangle = \{0\}.$$

By assumption, there exist  $x, y, z \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that

$$f(a) = xa, \quad f(b) = yb \quad \text{and} \quad f(a + b) = z(a + b).$$

But then

$$0 = f(a + b) - f(a) - f(b) = (z - x)a + (z - y)b.$$

Since  $\langle a \rangle \cap \langle b \rangle = \{0\}$ , it thus follows that

$$(z - x)a = 0 \quad \text{and} \quad (z - y)b = 0 \implies xa = za \quad \text{and} \quad yb = zb.$$

Therefore  $f(a) = za$  and  $f(b) = zb$ , so  $f$  is mult. by  $z$  on all of  $G$ .  $\square$



## Solution II (3/4)

### Induction step

Now let  $G$  be an abelian group on  $n \geq 3$  generators, say  $G = \langle a_1, \dots, a_n \rangle$ . Then consider the subgroups

$$H_1 = \langle a_1, a_n \rangle, \quad H_2 = \langle a_1, \dots, a_{n-1} \rangle, \quad H_3 = \langle a_2, \dots, a_n \rangle.$$

### Induction step

Now let  $G$  be an abelian group on  $n \geq 3$  generators, say  $G = \langle a_1, \dots, a_n \rangle$ . Then consider the subgroups

$$H_1 = \langle a_1, a_n \rangle, \quad H_2 = \langle a_1, \dots, a_{n-1} \rangle, \quad H_3 = \langle a_2, \dots, a_n \rangle.$$

By the induction hypothesis, the map  $f : G \rightarrow G$  will be given by multiplication by some fixed integers  $k_i$  on  $H_i$  for  $i \in \{1, 2, 3\}$ .

## Solution II (3/4)

### Induction step

Now let  $G$  be an abelian group on  $n \geq 3$  generators, say  $G = \langle a_1, \dots, a_n \rangle$ . Then consider the subgroups

$$H_1 = \langle a_1, a_n \rangle, \quad H_2 = \langle a_1, \dots, a_{n-1} \rangle, \quad H_3 = \langle a_2, \dots, a_n \rangle.$$

By the induction hypothesis, the map  $f : G \rightarrow G$  will be given by multiplication by some fixed integers  $k_i$  on  $H_i$  for  $i \in \{1, 2, 3\}$ . For  $i, j \in \{1, 2, 3\}$ , this means that on  $H_i \cap H_j$ , multiplication by  $k_i$  and  $k_j$  is the same. Therefore  $(k_i - k_j)(H_i \cap H_j) = 0$ ,

## Solution II (3/4)

### Induction step

Now let  $G$  be an abelian group on  $n \geq 3$  generators, say  $G = \langle a_1, \dots, a_n \rangle$ . Then consider the subgroups

$$H_1 = \langle a_1, a_n \rangle, \quad H_2 = \langle a_1, \dots, a_{n-1} \rangle, \quad H_3 = \langle a_2, \dots, a_n \rangle.$$

By the induction hypothesis, the map  $f : G \rightarrow G$  will be given by multiplication by some fixed integers  $k_i$  on  $H_i$  for  $i \in \{1, 2, 3\}$ . For  $i, j \in \{1, 2, 3\}$ , this means that on  $H_i \cap H_j$ , multiplication by  $k_i$  and  $k_j$  is the same. Therefore  $(k_i - k_j)(H_i \cap H_j) = 0$ , and  $f$  on  $H_i \cap H_j$  can be described as multiplication by any number in the arithmetic progression

$$A_{ij} = \{k_j + (k_i - k_j)m \mid m \in \mathbb{Z}\}.$$

## Solution II (3/4)

### Induction step

Now let  $G$  be an abelian group on  $n \geq 3$  generators, say  $G = \langle a_1, \dots, a_n \rangle$ . Then consider the subgroups

$$H_1 = \langle a_1, a_n \rangle, \quad H_2 = \langle a_1, \dots, a_{n-1} \rangle, \quad H_3 = \langle a_2, \dots, a_n \rangle.$$

By the induction hypothesis, the map  $f : G \rightarrow G$  will be given by multiplication by some fixed integers  $k_i$  on  $H_i$  for  $i \in \{1, 2, 3\}$ . For  $i, j \in \{1, 2, 3\}$ , this means that on  $H_i \cap H_j$ , multiplication by  $k_i$  and  $k_j$  is the same. Therefore  $(k_i - k_j)(H_i \cap H_j) = 0$ , and  $f$  on  $H_i \cap H_j$  can be described as multiplication by any number in the arithmetic progression

$$A_{ij} = \{k_j + (k_i - k_j)m \mid m \in \mathbb{Z}\}.$$

Do these arithmetic progressions all have a number in common?

## Solution II (4/4)

### Proposition

Consider three arithmetic progressions inside  $\mathbb{Z}$ . Suppose that pairwise they have a number in common. Then all three of them have a number in common.

## Solution II (4/4)

### Proposition

Consider three arithmetic progressions inside  $\mathbb{Z}$ . Suppose that pairwise they have a number in common. Then all three of them have a number in common.

I will leave the proof as an exercise :)

## Solution II (4/4)

### Proposition

Consider three arithmetic progressions inside  $\mathbb{Z}$ . Suppose that pairwise they have a number in common. Then all three of them have a number in common.

I will leave the proof as an exercise :)

### Completing the proof

Note that the arithmetic progressions  $A_{ij} = \{k_j + (k_i - k_j)m \mid m \in \mathbb{Z}\}$  contain by construction both the numbers  $k_i$  and  $k_j$ . Therefore,  $A_{12}$ ,  $A_{23}$  and  $A_{31}$  pairwise have a number in common. It follows that all three share some number  $k$ .



## Solution II (4/4)

### Proposition

Consider three arithmetic progressions inside  $\mathbb{Z}$ . Suppose that pairwise they have a number in common. Then all three of them have a number in common.

I will leave the proof as an exercise :)

### Completing the proof

Note that the arithmetic progressions  $A_{ij} = \{k_j + (k_i - k_j)m \mid m \in \mathbb{Z}\}$  contain by construction both the numbers  $k_i$  and  $k_j$ . Therefore,  $A_{12}$ ,  $A_{23}$  and  $A_{31}$  pairwise have a number in common. It follows that all three share some number  $k$ . By definition, this means that  $f$  on each of

$$a_1 \in (H_1 \cap H_2) \quad a_2, \dots, a_{n-1} \in (H_2 \cap H_3) \quad \text{and} \quad a_n \in (H_3 \cap H_1)$$

is given by multiplication by  $k$ .

## Solution II (4/4)

### Proposition

Consider three arithmetic progressions inside  $\mathbb{Z}$ . Suppose that pairwise they have a number in common. Then all three of them have a number in common.

I will leave the proof as an exercise :)

### Completing the proof

Note that the arithmetic progressions  $A_{ij} = \{k_j + (k_i - k_j)m \mid m \in \mathbb{Z}\}$  contain by construction both the numbers  $k_i$  and  $k_j$ . Therefore,  $A_{12}$ ,  $A_{23}$  and  $A_{31}$  pairwise have a number in common. It follows that all three share some number  $k$ . By definition, this means that  $f$  on each of

$$a_1 \in (H_1 \cap H_2) \quad a_2, \dots, a_{n-1} \in (H_2 \cap H_3) \quad \text{and} \quad a_n \in (H_3 \cap H_1)$$

is given by multiplication by  $k$ . This shows  $f(a_i) = ka_i$  for all generators  $a_i$  of  $G$ , so  $f$  is multiplication by  $k$  on all of  $G$ . □

## Question

Define a function  $f : \mathbb{N} \setminus \{1\} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  by

$$f(n) = \begin{cases} n^2 - 1 & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ n/2 & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

When does the sequence  $n, f(n), f(f(n)), \dots$  ever reach the number 1?

## Solution III (1/4)

### Question

Define a function  $f : \mathbb{N} \setminus \{1\} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  by

$$f(n) = \begin{cases} n^2 - 1 & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ n/2 & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

When does the sequence  $n, f(n), f(f(n)), \dots$  ever reach the number 1?

Let's make our lives a little bit easier:

### Question

Define a function  $g : \mathbb{N}_{\text{odd}} \setminus \{1\} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}_{\text{odd}}$  by

$$g(n) = k \quad \text{where} \quad n^2 - 1 = 2^m \cdot k \quad \text{with } k \text{ odd.}$$

When does the sequence  $n, g(n), g(g(n)), \dots$  ever reach the number 1?

## Solution III (2/4)

### Lemma

It holds that  $g(n) < n$  if and only if  $n = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$ .

## Solution III (2/4)

### Lemma

It holds that  $g(n) < n$  if and only if  $n = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$ .

### Proof.

We have seen before that  $g(2^t \pm 1) = 2^{t-1} \pm 1$ . For other  $n$ , one of the factors of  $n^2 - 1 = (n + 1)(n - 1)$  will contain precisely one factor of 2. Since neither is a power of 2 by assumption, after taking away all factors of 2, both will be at least 3.

## Solution III (2/4)

### Lemma

It holds that  $g(n) < n$  if and only if  $n = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$ .

### Proof.

We have seen before that  $g(2^t \pm 1) = 2^{t-1} \pm 1$ . For other  $n$ , one of the factors of  $n^2 - 1 = (n + 1)(n - 1)$  will contain precisely one factor of 2. Since neither is a power of 2 by assumption, after taking away all factors of 2, both will be at least 3. Therefore

$$g(n) \geq 3 \cdot \frac{n-1}{2} \geq n$$

for  $n \geq 3$ , completing the proof. □

## Solution III (2/4)

### Lemma

It holds that  $g(n) < n$  if and only if  $n = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$ .

### Proof.

We have seen before that  $g(2^t \pm 1) = 2^{t-1} \pm 1$ . For other  $n$ , one of the factors of  $n^2 - 1 = (n + 1)(n - 1)$  will contain precisely one factor of 2. Since neither is a power of 2 by assumption, after taking away all factors of 2, both will be at least 3. Therefore

$$g(n) \geq 3 \cdot \frac{n-1}{2} \geq n$$

for  $n \geq 3$ , completing the proof. □

Any sequence  $n, g(n), g(g(n)), \dots$  that ever ends at 1, must go down at some point. Therefore, some number of the form  $2^t \pm 1$  must appear in the sequence. We therefore reduce to solving  $g(n) = 2^t \pm 1$ .



### Proposition

The odd positive integers  $n$  for which  $g(n) = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$  are precisely those  $2^t \pm 1$  themselves, and additionally the three exceptional solutions  $n = 11$ ,  $n = 23$  and  $n = 181$ .

## Solution III (3/4)

### Proposition

The odd positive integers  $n$  for which  $g(n) = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$  are precisely those  $2^t \pm 1$  themselves, and additionally the three exceptional solutions  $n = 11$ ,  $n = 23$  and  $n = 181$ .

### Proof.

We must find all solutions to the equations

$$n^2 - 1 = (2^t \pm 1) \cdot 2^m \iff n^2 = 2^{t+m} \pm 2^m + 1.$$

## Solution III (3/4)

### Proposition

The odd positive integers  $n$  for which  $g(n) = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$  are precisely those  $2^t \pm 1$  themselves, and additionally the three exceptional solutions  $n = 11$ ,  $n = 23$  and  $n = 181$ .

### Proof.

We must find all solutions to the equations

$$n^2 - 1 = (2^t \pm 1) \cdot 2^m \iff n^2 = 2^{t+m} \pm 2^m + 1.$$

Fortunately, we may appeal to the 2002 article “The equations  $2^n \pm 2^m \pm 2^l = z^2$ ” by László Szalay and claim the result. □

## Solution III (3/4)

### Proposition

The odd positive integers  $n$  for which  $g(n) = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$  are precisely those  $2^t \pm 1$  themselves, and additionally the three exceptional solutions  $n = 11$ ,  $n = 23$  and  $n = 181$ .

### Proof.

We must find all solutions to the equations

$$n^2 - 1 = (2^t \pm 1) \cdot 2^m \iff n^2 = 2^{t+m} \pm 2^m + 1.$$

Fortunately, we may appeal to the 2002 article “The equations  $2^n \pm 2^m \pm 2^l = z^2$ ” by László Szalay and claim the result. □

So, we reduce to finding all  $n$  such that

$$g(n) \in \{11, 23, 181\}.$$

Note that all of these are prime.

## Solution III (4/4)

### Lemma

If  $g(n) = p$  is prime, then  $p = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$ .

## Solution III (4/4)

### Lemma

If  $g(n) = p$  is prime, then  $p = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$ .

### Proof.

If  $g(n) = p$  is prime, then

$$(n - 1)(n + 1) = p \cdot 2^m.$$

But one of  $n - 1$  and  $n + 1$  will contain precisely one factor of 2.

## Solution III (4/4)

### Lemma

If  $g(n) = p$  is prime, then  $p = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$ .

### Proof.

If  $g(n) = p$  is prime, then

$$(n - 1)(n + 1) = p \cdot 2^m.$$

But one of  $n - 1$  and  $n + 1$  will contain precisely one factor of 2.

Therefore, one is either 2, yielding  $n \in \{1, 3\}$ , or  $2p$ , yielding

$(n - 1)(n + 1) = 2p(2p \pm 2)$ . But then  $p \pm 1 = 2^{m-2}$ . □

The remaining values 11, 23 and 181 are not of this form, so:

## Solution III (4/4)

### Lemma

If  $g(n) = p$  is prime, then  $p = 2^t \pm 1$  for some  $t \in \mathbb{N}$ .

### Proof.

If  $g(n) = p$  is prime, then

$$(n-1)(n+1) = p \cdot 2^m.$$

But one of  $n-1$  and  $n+1$  will contain precisely one factor of 2.

Therefore, one is either 2, yielding  $n \in \{1, 3\}$ , or  $2p$ , yielding

$(n-1)(n+1) = 2p(2p \pm 2)$ . But then  $p \pm 1 = 2^{m-2}$ . □

The remaining values 11, 23 and 181 are not of this form, so:

### Theorem

The only odd numbers for which the sequence  $n, f(n), f(f(n)), \dots$  eventually reaches 1 are precisely all numbers of the form  $2^t \pm 1$  and additionally the exceptional values  $n \in \{11, 23, 181\}$ .



# Thanks for listening!

181 → 16380 → 8190 → 4095 → 16769024 → 8384512 → 4192256  
→ 2096128 → 1048064 → 524032 → 262016 → 131008 → 65504  
→ 32752 → 16376 → 8188 → 4094 → 2047 → 4190208 → 2095104  
→ 1047552 → 523776 → 261888 → 130944 → 65472 → 32736  
→ 16368 → 8184 → 4092 → 2046 → 1023 → 1046528 → 523264  
→ 261632 → 130816 → 65408 → 32704 → 16352 → 8176 → 4088  
→ 2044 → 1022 → 511 → 261120 → 130560 → 65280 → 32640  
→ 16320 → 8160 → 4080 → 2040 → 1020 → 510 → 255 → 65024  
→ 32512 → 16256 → 8128 → 4064 → 2032 → 1016 → 508 → 254  
→ 127 → 16128 → 8064 → 4032 → 2016 → 1008 → 504 → 252  
→ 126 → 63 → 3968 → 1984 → 992 → 496 → 248 → 124 → 62  
→ 31 → 960 → 480 → 240 → 120 → 60 → 30 → 15 → 224 → 112  
→ 56 → 28 → 14 → 7 → 48 → 24 → 12 → 6 → 3 → 8 → 4 → 2 → 1.